

Practice: Critiquing Teacher Feedback

Directions: Recently our school announced that the vending machines in the cafeteria (juice, snacks, and candy) would be removed. Write an essay that states your opinion on this change. Keep in mind that the purpose of the essay is to state your opinion and convince someone else of your point of view. Also remember what we have been learning about persuasive writing. Be sure to check your work for grammar, spelling, and punctuation.

Henry's Paragraph

Juice is good for you and you should drink it every day. I like orange juice best but my grandma say I should drink cranbury instead. I think she say that because that is the kind of juice she like. So it would be good to have juice machines in the cafeteria.

I don't think its fare that they took our snack machine away because kid's need snacks sometime. We work-ing hard here and we gonna miss the snacks. If they gonna take the snack machine they gotta give us some other thing to eat beside that bad cafeteria food.

Effective Feedback Criteria

Feedback Criteria	Yes or No	Comments (strengths and weaknesses)
Provide feedback that addresses what is correct and elaborates on what students need to do next.		
Provide criterion-referenced feedback.		
Engage students in the feedback process.		
Provide goal-referenced feedback.		
Provide actionable feedback ("good job" is not actionable).		
Provide user-friendly feedback (specific and personalized).		

Teacher Feedback Examples (Seventh Grade)

Teacher A

Miss A: My gosh, Henry! Were you here when we worked on persuasive writing?

Henry: Yep!

Miss A: Well, you must have been asleep. Do you remember when we were talking about writing three paragraphs in persuasive writing?

Henry: Yeah, I did do two paragraphs.

Miss A: Henry, are you planning on passing English this year? Because if you are, you need to start getting your act together. I've seen third graders who write better than this!

Henry: I do want to pass.

Miss A: I am starting to think you aren't willing to work hard enough to be a good student! I think you are thinking about what you are going to have for lunch instead of paying attention in class.

Henry: Oh.

Miss A: Let's look at what you did. You did start the sentences with capital letters. At least you got that right. I'm going to mark all the errors so you can fix them.

Henry: OK.

Miss A: It's not that hard, Henry!

Henry: Oh.

Miss A: Do you want to try this again?

Henry: *(Shrugs.)*

Miss A: I'll let you do this again. But I want three paragraphs this time.

Henry: Oh. *(Rolls eyes.)*

Miss A: Try it again, Henry, and let me see if you have been listening to me.

Teacher B

Mr. B: Henry, let's look at your paragraph.

Henry: OK.

Mr. B: Let's read the directions and be sure you know what I wanted you to do. *(Read the directions together.)*

Mr. B: What did I ask you to do?

Henry: Write about my opinion on the snack machines in the cafeteria.

Mr. B: Yes. Did you do that, Henry?

Henry: Kind of. I did say in the second paragraph that it isn't fair that they took the machines away.

Mr. B: Yes, you did. So when I read that, I know your opinion about the snack machines. Good. Tell me why you wrote this first paragraph.

Henry: Because there was a juice machine before and now there isn't, so I thought I should say something about juice.

Mr. B: I can see what you were thinking, but does that really tell me about your opinion on the machines?

Henry: I guess not.

Mr. B: I have an idea. How about if we start with the second paragraph? You have some good ideas here. Let's work on this one paragraph and make it really good.

Henry: OK. I can do that.

Mr. B: You are right. You can do it. There are some other things.

Henry: There are?

Mr. B: Let's look at your second paragraph. Let's see if there are some parts of it that could be better.

Henry: OK.

Mr. B: Do you remember about our chart of words we aren't going to use in our writing? Our "tombstone" words?

Henry: Yeah, we have a chart of those words.

Mr. B: Look at your writing. Did you use any of those words in your second paragraph?

Henry: Yeah, I did. I have *gotta* and *gonna*. Are those bad words?

Mr. B: No, Henry. They are not bad words. They are words we might use when we are talking to someone but we should not use those words in our written work if we want it to be correct. That's why we have the chart. We all say words like *gonna* sometimes, but when we are writing something we should try not to use those words.

Henry: OK.

Mr. B: Henry, let me show you one more item. You also had a problem with contractions. Look at that again. I know you know about contractions. I want you to check with your writing partner before you turn this in to me again.

Henry: OK. I think I can do this.

Mr. B: Henry, I know you can. Now go do it!